



Site Stakeholder Group

Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

Minutes of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group held on Friday 6 June 2008 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan

In Attendance:

Cllr Ian Lindsay (representing Annandale East) (Chair)
Jill Callander (SSG Secretary)
Dave Wilson (Chapelcross Site Director)
Cllr Sean Marshall (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Archie Dryburgh (representing Annandale East)
Cllr Len Moore (Federation of Community Councils)
Cllr Ian Carruthers (representing Annandale South)
Nick Woodcock (Chapelcross Deputy Site Director)
Pam Duerden (Chapelcross ESS&Q Manager)
Marianne Cook (Scottish Executive)
Keith Riding (NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager)
Les Davies (Chapelcross Site Inspector – NII)
Steve Southam (D&G Council)
Murray Bainbridge (Scottish Enterprise D&G)
Paul Allan (Creca Hall Chair)
Insp Robert Gibson (D&G Constabulary)
Alan Hill (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)

Apologies:

Cllr Gail McGregor (representing Annandale North)
Cllr Richard Brodie (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Michael Dickie (representing Annandale North)
Alan Hill (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)
SEPA Representative
Elizabeth Gray (Scottish Executive)
Janice Rough (D&G Education Department)
Cllr A Graham (representing Annandale East)
David Mundell – MP
Elaine Murray – MSP
David Gurney (D&G Council)
Cllr Ted Brown (representing Annandale North)
Paul Giles (Chapelcross HR Manager)
Alan Hill (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)

Present:

Claudia Beamish (Parliamentary Candidate, Labour)
Willie McNairn (Blackhills Farm)
Nigel Monckton (Magnox North)
Abbey Rogerson (Annandale Observer)

Frank McGowan (Magnox North)
David Lessels (Solway Shellfish & Research Ltd)
Avril Campbell (Magnox North)

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the June meeting of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group.

2. Announcement and Apologies

The Secretary gave the apologies as listed above.

3. Minutes of the meeting held on Friday 7th March 2008

The minutes were endorsed by Cllr Archie Dryburgh and seconded by Len Moore

4. Matters arising from the minutes

- Land Holdings - S Southam addressed the question raised by W McNairn at the last meeting regarding ownership of land in the Windermere Road area. S Southam confirmed that D&G are not the owners of the land in question, but also that there were areas of land being looked at for industrial development, although at this stage was unable to comment further.
- Chair welcomed Dr Daniel Chandler from NHS who was representing Dr David Breen. S Marshall updated the Group with regard to the Westlakes Health Study. There has been no additional information regarding the Study received but should this be the case S Marshall confirmed that this would be distributed to the SSG Members.
- In response to an action placed on S Marshall at SSG Meeting held on 7 March 08 to arrange for an update on land holdings by David Atkinson, Director for NDA Property Management at our meeting, S Marshall confirmed that although David Atkinson was unable to attend the June meeting he will attend the September Meeting to address issues regarding Critchell Downs Rules, effluent pipeline and various questions regarding NDA land holdings.

ACTION – S Marshall to confirm meeting details with David Atkinson, NDA

- Cllr Ogilvie requested an update from M Bainbridge with regard to Socio Economic funding by Scottish Enterprise. M Bainbridge confirmed that funding agreed in principle in 2004 will still be made available. Chair asked if the Scottish Enterprise funding criteria guidelines were available for the SSG members and M Bainbridge confirmed that these were part of the Scottish Enterprise Strategy Document and this is available through the Scottish Enterprise website - www.scottish-enterprise.com

5. Chapelcross Site Director's Report

D Wilson presented his report using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes).

Summary

- **Top Level Statistics** – 3 low level minor injuries, 174 days since last Lost Time Accident. Scheduled performance is 2% ahead of programme with a cost performance saving of 13%. Update given regarding current workforce numbers.
- **Safety**
 - **Site Safety Standown** – presentation to Chapelcross workforce by Ken Woodward, Coca-Cola employee who lost his sight due to an accident in the workplace – highly recommended presentation, information re contact details for Ken Woodward available through Communications Dept at Chapelcross.
 - **Radsafe Exercise 4 June 08** – Chapelcross undertook this exercise as part of national programme of exercises for responses to potential road traffic incidents which may involve radioactive materials.
- **NII Level 1 Emergency Exercise** – Failed Emergency Exercise "India" on 30 April 08, due to failure of electronic muster arrangements. Remedial arrangements undertaken and adequate demonstration completed on 29 May 08 – further improvements are underway. Full re-demonstration of Level 1 Emergency Exercise is scheduled prior to the 31 October 08 - date is to be finalised.
- **Material Found on Foreshore** – Three instances of "finds" from 19-21 May 08. SEPA informed and further sampling undertaken 24-26 May 08 which were clear.
- **Key Projects Update** – Defuelling, Asbestos, Shipment of Nuclear Material to Capenhurst. Confirmed that Sellafield reprocessing is going well at present.
- **Socio Economic Highlights** - Financial spend update and awards recently received.

D Wilson closed his presentation by summarising that good progress was currently being made on key projects and some key learning points had been taken from the recent NII Level 1 Exercise.

Questions and Observations

Defuelling

Cllr Dryburgh asked D Wilson; although the programme indicates that it is expected that Chapelcross will be able to move 1.5 flasks per week would it be possible to use reprocessing slots at Sellafield missed by other Sites? D Wilson confirmed that this was the case and that we would be actively looking for slots. Cllr Dryburgh asked if there was any monetary benefits from the NDA should Chapelcross defuel early. D Wilson confirmed that there would be no extra funds and that the focus would be on meeting commitments and targets, and whilst doing this make savings where possible through efficiencies.

J Rogerson asked D Wilson; if when the first element is removed at the end of June this would be the start of defuelling? D Wilson explained that active commissioning authorisation Licence Instrument has to be obtained from the NII. The site will then demonstrate active commissioning before bulk defuelling can be undertaken - these are basically the same operation but Licence Instruments detail the amounts of fuel physically removed. D Wilson confirmed that the fuel would be removed slowly and steadily, with safety paramount, and that learning would be gained from experience.

CX Employees

J Rogerson asked D Wilson; if the 417 employees mentioned in the Site Director's Report included fixed term employees? D Wilson confirmed that this was the case.

Cllr Dryburgh asked for assurance that both new and existing Staff working in the defuelling areas were being properly trained and updated with regard to the safety aspect of the defuelling process. D Wilson reiterated that active commissioning would be undertaken slowly and safely to ensure maximum awareness and this was not only an opportunity to learn but to raise our safety standards and improve on existing measures in place. Cllr Dryburgh also asked if it was planned to bring all of the Reactor Pile Caps to the same high standard as Reactor 1. D Wilson confirmed that this is the case, following much positive feedback regarding the condition of the R1 Pile Cap and added that using our own teams would be beneficial.

Asbestos

J Rogerson asked D Wilson to confirm that the asbestos referred to in his presentation was actually still on site at Chapelcross. D Wilson responded and confirmed that although 70 tonnes of asbestos had been removed, it was being stored at Chapelcross. D Wilson explained that it was planned to undertake the bulk strip and await full characterisation which demonstrates that the asbestos is "clean" and could go for disposal as normal hazardous landfill. It is hoped that a super-compactor will be used when sufficient volume has been accumulated. It is also not appropriate to fill the low level waste repository with very low/non active materials.

W McNairn asked that when the asbestos was being stripped was the jointing from trunking being removed. D Wilson reported that during a bulk strip there was no dismantling of the equipment to remove jointing compound.

Contamination on Foreshore

Chair Ian Lindsay asked for a comparison regarding the particles found on the foreshore to everyday materials that we are exposed to, eg granite. P Duerden responded by saying that the few particles found were historical materials and very small. In terms of exposure to everyday radioactive materials the particles produced a localised dose rate only and as such an individual would have to be in contact with the particles to receive any significant dose uptake.

Effluent Pipeline

Cllr Marshall asked for an update regarding the effluent line cleaning project. D Wilson confirmed that he would update the group regarding progress with the pipeline at the next SSG.

[ACTION – D Wilson to give presentation on Effluent Pipeline at SSG Meeting on 5th September 08.](#)

National Stakeholder Group (NSG)

Cllr Marshall reported on the NSG Meeting held in Edinburgh on 20/22 May 08. With respect to the NDA Business Plan there was a steer towards high hazard Sites eg Sellafield and Dounreay and that Chapelcross had been 3rd highest on the list. D Wilson gave the group information regarding how the hazard index is compiled using chemical toxicity as well as radiation. Although index is good for comparison in reality it is hard to gauge its uses. Cllr Marshall asked if there was any connection between the amount of hazard and the amount of funds allocated by the Nuclear Decommissioning Authority. K Riding responded by giving an overview on the national perspective of hazard scales but also pointed out that the fact that the fuel was in a safe and stable state in the reactors and was given a low index rating because of this.

The Site Director's report was endorsed and the Chair thanked D Wilson for the very informative presentation.

6. NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager's Report

K Riding presented his report using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes).

Summary

- **Site Quarterly Review** - Update on Chapelcross and review of projects
 - **Project Delivery** - A good steady performance on key projects at Chapelcross. Six months ago at Chapelcross there were some issues regarding project delivery but K Riding acknowledged that D Wilson had made some significant changes and there have been improvements seen.
 - **Resources** - It was noted that staff movements had impacted on projects but some good recruitment moves had been made and these have had a positive impact. It was hoped that Chapelcross would retain as well as attract staff in the future.
 - **Commercial** - Commercial performance remains effective.
 - **Stakeholder Management** - Acknowledgement that Chapelcross has excellent stakeholder management and that K Riding was delighted with the work which was underway. He reported that there is a possibility that Amy Gill as Site Project Controls Manager may be joining Keith at NDA Chapelcross.
 - **Portfolio Management** – Explanation that the NDA contract is with the Site Licence Company (SLC) across the 5 Magnox North Sites. Improvements to management arrangements are now becoming effective and working better.
 - K Riding detailed forthcoming challenges for Chapelcross as - the *effluent pipeline*, *Scottish Power leases* and *Scottish Environment Protection Agency (SEPA)* with whom there are currently some IR issues. Scottish Power lease a compound which is within the Chapelcross Site – this is a historic lease and K Riding advised that the NDA legal team are currently addressing this and he hoped to be able to update the group at the next SSG Meeting.
- **NDA Site Specifics** - NDA Impacts on Chapelcross directly.
 - **MOP 8** – Continues to programme, NDA are pleased with progress and the focus is for defuelling to start at the end of June.
 - **Site Funding** – K Riding confirmed that funding is stable for this year and himself and D Wilson over the next 2/3 months will be looking to identify opportunities.
 - **Socio Economics** – The 5 business case submissions from Chapelcross are being given consideration and will be addressed by the Board on 26 June 08. He will update us as soon as possible regarding the outcome and hopes for positive news.

- **Assets Realisation** – On the closing date of 30 April there had been two expressions of interest noted for the Chapelcross Site. K Riding will update the group regarding these as soon as he is able to.
- **Land and Estates** – The NDA have been looking at opportunities for their land and estates.
- **NDA Current Issues** – Managed back to NDA Headquarters and affects all Sites
 - **National Stakeholders Group, Edinburgh** – Although overall the event had been a success the NDA are looking to make improvements. An explanation was given by K Riding regarding the re-structuring of some areas of the NDA.
 - **NDA Business Plan** – this has now been published and hard copies are available. It is also available to view on the NDA Website - www.nda.gov.uk If anyone would like a hard copy please contact Jill Callander at Chapelcross.
 - **Socio Economic Plan** – This document is now available and the NDA are also working with other government groups on the production of a Corporate Responsibility Policy (CRP) A CRP will set down clear guidelines
 - **Competition and Low Level Waste Repository – Drigg** – Contracts were signed on 31 March and the project is going well. There had been the possibility that the Low Level Waste may have been stopped but this has not in fact happened.
 - **NDA New Executive Board** – Update on new positions within the NDA: Chairman – Steven Henwood, HR Director – Jim McLaughlin, Commercial Director – John Clarke. The restructuring of the NDA mentioned at the NSG has provided a more strategic structure over the past four months.
 - **Value Framework** – It will enable NDA to explain and communicate more clearly and transparently how and why the NDA manage their contracts.
 - **S3, Safe Secure Site** – This report covers all reactor sites. S3 gathers information and identifies options for sites ranging between, either to close the gates and walk away or to speed up decommissioning. Keith also confirmed that it still the NDA's aspiration to decommission as outlined in the Business Plan. [ACTION – K Riding to determine if there is the possibility of a presentation on the outcome of the S3 findings.](#)

The Chair thanked Keith Riding for his report and confirmed that this can only help build on an already positive relationship with the NDA.

Questions & Observations

Community Support

Cllr Ogilvie welcomed the forward planning of the NDA with regard to the community support responsibility, making reference to Bridge House and previous disappointments regarding funding. He stated that he hoped that the Corporate Responsibility Policy was not to be a “talking shop” but more reality based. K Riding responded by acknowledging that previous statements giving support to some projects had not been fully realistic and clarity of guidelines was needed. It is hoped that the new CRP will be clear and realistic. Cllr Ogilvie thanked Keith and welcomed this planned clear and cautious approach which will not raise false expectations.

M Bainbridge asked K Riding if the new CPR Policy was to supersede the Socio Economic Policy? K Riding replied that this was not the case and that it would build upon and work with existing arrangements.

NDA Land Holdings

M Bainbridge raised a query with regard to the land holding at Chapelcross and asked if the interest shown was with regard to the Licenced or Non Licenced Site. K Riding replied that at the present time this information was confidential and he was unable to comment. M Bainbridge had read in a recent newspaper article that Energy Solutions had intentions to acquire the site primarily to enhance decommissioning and following this take over the entire site. K Riding was unable to comment on this. D Wilson confirmed that Energy Solutions had various ideas being raised but was also unable to comment at this present moment in time.

L Moore asked K Riding if the NDA had gifted 15 acres of land to a development company and suggested that this would have been better if it had been given to the community. K Riding stated that the NDA had not gifted any land and that if any land owned by the NDA changed ownership it would be sold at commercial market value rates and that any implications to the community would also be considered.

S3 Project

Cllr Dryburgh raised concerns regarding the S3 (Safe, Secure, Site) outcome. Within the Energy Act there had been undertakings to develop staff and skills and that funding would be made available. Cllr Dryburgh asked K Riding if it was now the challenge of the NDA to the SLC to make rather than buy. K Riding confirmed that the NDA were addressing all options available. Paul Giles and D Wilson will give an update on the transition management project at the next meeting. D Wilson reported that the main drive for Chapelcross was "value for money". Cllr Dryburgh challenged this, and asked if it should not be "best Value" rather than "value for money"? D Wilson confirmed that this meant safe, secure and efficient delivery of the programme.

J Rogerson said he was concerned that there was a possibility of 7/8 options and looked forward to hearing a decision from the NDA regarding these issues. K Riding reported that prior to S3 there had been many unanswered questions and that the information being gathered by S3 would give a greater understanding of each particular site. S3 would also be addressing funding, accelerated decommissioning and gave an example of the Chapelcross Heat Exchangers which are outside compared to some sites where they are inside buildings – therefore the stripping of the asbestos which is exposed to the elements would need greater priority than those on sites where they were inside. K Riding reported that S3 is a process for gaining a better understanding to allow better judgement when assessing funding, giving a clearer understanding of the bigger picture regarding all of the sites.

J Rogerson stated that he believed that following the NDA giving commitment to decommission Chapelcross, if there was to be a change in plans and the site was to be left for say, 100 years, then there would be a loss of confidence in the NDA. K Riding responded by saying that year by year there are changes and he was unable to comment further.

Early Site Clearance and ILW Repository

Cllr Marshall raised the issue of lead site for early site clearance and said that this issue had also been raised at the NSG in Edinburgh in May. He also pointed out that without sustainable employment many skilled people, because of the low wage economy in Dumfries & Galloway, were moving away from the area. K Riding responded by saying that he accepted the problems faced with future funding but with the restructuring of the NDA they hoped to address and resolve this through the Socio-Economic Policy, CRP and S3.

Cllr Ogilvie asked if there could be any update given from the NDA with regard to early site clearance and pointed out the problems with regard to government policy and waste remaining in Scotland. He asked if there had been any indication from government whether the best option would be above or below ground. K Riding responded by confirming that at present the ILW store at Chapelcross would be as planned and above ground. Cllr Ogilvie said that if the public thought that Chapelcross was to become a store it may be perceived as a dump and that he was concerned about negative PR. Cllr Ogilvie said that If this store was to happen early, notification would be appreciated. M Cook reported that a near surface policy was being developed with the NDA.

Cllr Ogilvie raised the point of the NDA asking a community to take a repository and that the difference between Scottish and national policy would have to be addressed. K Riding confirmed that there would be many aspects to consider eg funding, geology before any decision is made.

L Moore said that clarification was needed regarding the clean up process or whether the reactors may be left. He felt that current Government was unable to decide the fate and that we need to push for a decision one way or the other. K Riding confirmed that the NDA focus is committed to delivery of the MOP 8 programme.

Scottish Power Compound

Cllr Dryburgh asked if actions had been put in place to prevent any reoccurrence of a recent event at the Scottish Power compound at Chapelcross. D Wilson explained that Scottish Power had recently laid new electric cables and following this during the erection of a fence an employee of a contractor working for Scottish Power put a metal bar through an 11KV cable. D Wilson advised that all work had been suspended at the compound and an investigation is underway, chaired by Mark Blackley, Engineering Manager at Chapelcross. This investigation will strengthen working arrangements and CDM responsibilities are being addressed.

Socio Economic Funding

Cllr Carruthers referred to the declarations of interest regarding land at Chapelcross and that some smaller companies had expressed interest in land. K Riding stated that interest in any land should be declared as soon as possible. M Bainbridge explained that any interest regarding the proposed Business Park at Chapelcross should be lodged with Katalyst or with Sean Marshall, and the declaration of interest with respect to land holdings was a completely separate issue.

Cllr Marshall asked if Katalyst or Scottish Enterprise had submitted an interest with regard to the Business Park land proposals on Chapelcross runway. M Bainbridge replied that as far as he was aware Katalyst had not been through the declaration process but that 2 valuations had been completed on the land by Scottish Executive and the NDA. K Riding ended the discussion by confirming that the invitation to declare interest in NDA land had been open to everyone, farmers, private individuals etc and repeated that to date he was aware of only 2 declarations with regard to Chapelcross.

Socio-Economic Policy

W McNairn asked why the responses regarding the 2006 Socio Economic Policy had not been placed on the NDA website. [ACTION Keith Riding to respond to Willie McNairn with regard to this](#)

The Chair thanked Keith Riding for his presentation and information provided.

7. NDA Property Management Presentation

Presentation postponed until next SSG Meeting on 5th September 2008.

8. Other Reports from SSG Bodies

NII

Les Davies referred to the NII Site Inspector Quarterly Report which has been circulated with the previous minutes. There were no questions relating to this report.

National Stakeholder Group (NSG) Update

Cllr Marshall and Chair Lindsay both attended the NSG and briefed the group. All 19 sites are invited to meet at the NSG separately on the day prior to the main NSG to discuss SSG related issues. Terms of reference are being developed and the Socio Economic Policy and the Business Plan were discussed. It was felt there were valuable lessons to be learnt from this meeting.

D&G Constabulary

Inspector R Gibson from Dumfries & Galloway Constabulary reported on the success of the recent Radsafe Exercise held at Chapelcross giving detail on many positive points.

Scottish Government

M Cook from Scottish Government reported on the Scottish Nuclear Sites Group held in March and advised that these meetings are to be held every 6 months with the next scheduled at the end of October.

9. Chapelcross Sub Groups Update

Socio-Economic

D Wilson and K Riding referred to the bid proposals mentioned on page 6 of the previous meeting minutes to advise that the 5 projects had been through the first NDA panel and the final review was scheduled for 26 June 2008. Cllr Marshall said that there had been no meeting of the Socio Economic Sub Group since March and that other projects had been put in abeyance. There is a CoRes Meeting scheduled to meet on Friday 13 June 08.

D Lessels had previously forwarded his proposal for funding to the NDA - this had not been through the SSG and to date no paperwork had been received. [ACTION - D Lessels to send both electronic and paper copies to S Marshall at Chapelcross.](#)

It is planned to have a meeting of the Socio Economic Sub Group in July / August to address these proposals. [ACTION – J Callander to arrange Sub Group Meeting](#)

Community Support

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall - details attached to previous Minutes.

Education Support

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall. Magnox North received two awards at the Determined to Succeed Awards and Showcase Event on 2nd June 08 at Easterbrook Hall. The first award was presented for National Employer Engagement Award from the Scottish Government and the second related to the Local Partnership Agreement with Hecklegirth School. It is recognised that Magnox North Chapelcross has led the way with regards developing links between businesses and primary schools within the area. Cllr Marshall thanked Dr J Rough for her continued support and commitment to the delivery of these projects.

Cllr Ogilvie commented on the request from Brydekirk School regarding funding for swimming lessons (which did not meet the criteria required for funding from the SSG Education Support Sub-Group) expressing his surprise that all schools did not automatically undertake swimming lessons as part of the physical education programme.

10. SSG Constitution Review

All members have been issued a copy of the NDA consultation document and Cllr Marshall urged everyone to respond individually to this document. It was decided to arrange a special Sub Group Meeting to address a response from the SSG. Volunteers to address this were - S Southam ,Chair, Cllr Marshall, Cllr Ogilvie, J Callander and P Giles. [ACTION – J Callander to arrange a meeting of a Sub Group to co-ordinate a response to this document and also to address the new constitution.](#)

Cllr Ogilvie commented on the comparison of criteria and many generic issues within the document and welcomed this review.

11. SSG Site Visit to Trawsfynda and Wylfa

J Callander urged members to return their response forms as soon as possible so that a decision could be made regarding the possibility of this visit.

12. AOB

None

13. Date of Next Meeting – Friday 5th September 2008 at 10am, Annan Council Chambers Annan.