



Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

Minutes of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group held on Friday 5 September 2008 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan

In Attendance:

Cllr Ian Lindsay (representing Annandale East) (Chair)
Jill Callander (SSG Secretary)
Dave Wilson (Chapelcross Site Director)
Cllr Sean Marshall (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Archie Dryburgh (representing Annandale East)
Cllr Len Moore (Federation of Community Councils)
Nick Woodcock (Chapelcross Deputy Site Director)
Pam Duerden (Chapelcross ESS&Q Manager)
Rob Hodgson (Chapelcross Decommissioning & Strategy Manager)
Elizabeth Gray (Scottish Government, Head of Radioactive Waste)
Stuart Hudson (Scottish Government)
Tony Godley (NDA Chapelcross Site Contract Manager)
Tony Smithers (NDA Property Management)
Les Davies (Chapelcross Site Inspector – NII)
Insp David Irving (D&G Constabulary)
Dave Johnstone (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)
John Riddet (Rural Payments and Inspections Directorate)
Cllr Richard Brodie (representing Annandale South)
Cllr A Graham (representing Annandale East)
Paul Giles (Chapelcross Transition Manager)

Apologies:

Cllr Michael Dickie (representing Annandale North)
SEPA Representative
Janice Rough (D&G Education Department)
David Mundell – MP
Elaine Murray – MSP
David Gurney (Civil Protection and Emergency Planning)
Cllr Ted Brown (representing Annandale North)
Marianne Cook (Scottish Government)
Keith Riding (NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager)
Steve Southam (D&G Council)
Murray Bainbridge (Scottish Enterprise D&G)
Paul Allan (Creca Hall Chair)
Neil Erskine (D&G Fire and Rescue Services)

Present:

Richard Flynn (NDA Communications Manager)
Willie McNairn (Blackhills Farm)
Nigel Monckton (Magnox North)
Lisa Herbert (Annandale Observer)

Rae Graham (Magnox North)
Avril Campbell (Magnox North)

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the September meeting of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group. Although Cllr A Graham was currently delayed in arrival he advised that he was happy for the meeting to commence. Due to the number of new faces around the table introductions were made.

2. Announcement and Apologies

The Secretary gave the apologies as listed above.

3. Minutes of the meeting held on Friday 7th March 2008

The minutes were endorsed by Cllr R Ogilvie and seconded by Cllr A Dryburgh

4. Matters arising from the minutes

- Property Management – An action placed on Sean Marshall with reference to NDA Land holdings was addressed and Sean Marshall confirmed that this topic would be addressed later in the meeting under Agenda item 6.
- Effluent Pipeline – In response to an action placed on D Wilson to report on the effluent pipeline, Dave Wilson explained that this would be covered in his Site Director's Report, item 4 on the Agenda.
- S3, Safe Secure Site – Keith Riding had been asked to determine if there was the possibility of a presentation of the S3 findings. In Keith's absence D Wilson reported that the S3 findings were still in draft format. It was agreed that this action should remain outstanding and be addressed at a later meeting when the information is available.

[ACTION – K Riding to report on the outcome of S3 findings when information is available.](#)

- NDA Socio Economic Policy 2006 on NDA Website – Willie McNairn had not received any further information re his initial request to see the responses regarding Socio Economics on the NDA website. Richard Flynn, Communications Officer for the NDA advised that there may be information to be found by viewing www.nda.gov.uk/stakeholders/socio-economic/index.cfm
- Socio Economic Sub Group – David Lessels has forwarded both electronic and paper copies to Jill Callander with regard to the Solway Shellfish and Research Ltd proposal. This proposal, along with one from Annandale and Eskdale Council for Voluntary Services – Design for Life and Annan Bruce Statue Project are to be considered by the new governing body to be set up later this year.
- SSG Constitution Review – A draft copy of the SSG Constitution had been issued to members and would be discussed under Agenda item 9.

5. Chapelcross Site Director's Report

D Wilson presented his report using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes).

Summary

- **Major highlight for Chapelcross** – start of defuelling commenced 18th August 2008, over four years since Chapelcross ended its generating life.
- **Top Level Statistics** – 9 low level minor injuries, 24 days since last Lost Time Accident. Scheduled performance and cost performance are both very good (SPI 0.99 and CPI 1.14) Update given regarding current workforce numbers.
- **NII Level 1 Emergency Exercise** – Following the failure of Emergency Exercise "India" on 30 April 08, there has been much progress made with regard to manual mustering and another exercise is scheduled to take place prior to our next Site Stakeholder Group Meeting in November.
- **Material Found on Foreshore** – Following three instances of "finds" from 19-21 May 08, D Wilson reported that shore surveys had continued and these have remained clear.

- **Effluent Pipeline** – The pipeline is now back in routine operation and the upgrade project is progressing well. Different options have been reviewed with regards to cleaning the pipeline and it is hoped to be able to implement a system which will reduce the time spent out of service. A full update will be given in early 2009.
- **Projects Update** – Defuelling – R1 defuelling commenced – 13 elements removed to date, R3 modifications ongoing and removal of fuel is hoped for early 2009, R2 and R4 modifications are being commissioned, Asbestos – weather containment progressing very well, Shipment of Nuclear Material to Capenhurst – this is ahead programme and it is confident that we will meet this target.
- **Socio Economic Highlights** - Financial spend update and awards recently received.
- **Stakeholder Engagement** – Many varied stakeholder events have taken place over the summer months with much interaction with a broad range of groups within the local community. Community Support is very active within the local area. D Wilson confirmed that Chapelcross is very happy to support local groups and is very willing to attend local community groups to bring everyone up to date with progress on the defuelling and decommissioning of Chapelcross Site.

D Wilson closed his presentation by summarising that the start of defuelling at Chapelcross was a major achievement, the asbestos removal project was going very well and the containment programme would soon become very visible and will change the appearance of the Site.

Questions and Observations

Defuelling

Chair Ian Lindsay stated how pleased the Site Stakeholder Group was to learn of the start of defuelling and gave full support on behalf of the SSG.

Len Moore asked why there are different numbers of rods in each reactor. R Hodgson answered this and explained that much of this was historical, rods had previously been removed and also space between cartridges had an effect on the figures.

Safety

Cllr Dryburgh asked D Wilson; with regard to a recent event on Site where a scaffolder was involved, had it been appropriate that he had been dismissed? D Wilson confirmed that it had been a Kitson's employee who had been working outside of the rules and following a meeting with the Managing Director and the Safety Manager to establish there were no cultural issues or trend, it was confirmed that the appropriate action was taken by Kitsons - additional supervision has also been put in place by Kitsons. Chair Ian Lindsay asked if it was Chapelcross's responsibility for control and safety of contractors. D Wilson assured the group that although they were not directly responsible there was much control and influence in place, with an additional level of supervision in place.

J Rogerson asked D Wilson; if he felt that there was ill feeling on site between Kitsons and Chapelcross employees? D Wilson said that following the incident there were mixed feelings but it was confirmed again that the correct action was taken and there is no issue of bad feeling. Cllr Dryburgh reported that following the Site Standown where the issues were openly addressed that there was not a low morale issue either.

L Davies confirmed that to provide adequate supervision of contractors, is one of the requirements of the Site Licence Conditions on a nuclear site, and a legal requirement over and above normal Health and Safety Requirements.

Effluent Pipeline

Willie McNairn asked if a building recently constructed along the pipeline belonged to Chapelcross. Cllr Ogilvie and Cllr Marshall confirmed that this building did in fact belong to Mr Walker who owns the scrap yard, adjacent to the pipeline, in Annan.

The Site Director's report was endorsed and the Chair thanked D Wilson for the very informative presentation.

6. NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager's Report

T Godley presented this report in the absence of K Riding using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes).

Summary

- **Site Quarterly Review** - Update on Chapelcross and review of projects
 - **Safety** – The NDA acknowledged the importance of Health and Safety to the Chapelcross Lead Team and confirmed the very strong safety culture at Chapelcross but were aware that investigations are underway to address some recent events which have occurred on site.
 - **Project Delivery** – There is still some concern with regard to project delivery but NDA are aware that these issues are being reviewed and addressed.
 - **Resources** – It was noted that that resources are still an issue but acknowledged that some key project delivery roles had recently been filled.
 - **Commercial** - Commercial performance remains good and the site is delivering what was programmed and within budget.
 - **Stakeholder Management** - Acknowledgement that Chapelcross has very strong and proactive stakeholder engagement.

- **NDA Site Specifics** - NDA Impacts on Chapelcross directly.
 - **MOP(Magnox Operating Plan) 8** – Continues to programme delighted to confirm that defuelling has begun and acknowledged the difficulties and challenges faced over the past few months.
 - **Socio Economics** – NDA is awaiting a response from BERR (Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform) with regard to the 5 business case proposals forwarded. It is hoped that the result will be imminent.

- **NDA Current Issues** – Managed back to NDA Headquarters and affects all Sites
 - **NDA Executive** - Dr Roxburgh has now left the NDA and Richard Waite is acting CEO.
 - **Sellafield PBO (Parent Body Organisation)** – The preferred bidder, Nuclear Management Partners Ltd, has now been announced made up by Washington International Holdings Ltd, Amec and Areva NC.
 - **NDA Competition** – this is not expected before the end of the year
 - **NDA Guidance to Site Stakeholder Groups.** T Godley updated the group with regard to the NDA Business Plan which will be out for consultation in early November giving detailed of proposed activities in 2009/2010 and proposed funding for that period.

The Chair thanked Tony Godley for his report and presentation.

Questions & Observations

NDA Plan/Strategy

CLr Ogilvie welcomed the forward planning of the NDA with regard to the community support. CLr Ogilvie also asked when the business strategy was finalised would final site clearance be announced in the document. T Godley responded by saying that if this was approved, then it would be included in the business strategy.

Audits

Cllr Dryburgh raised the issue of audits, and pointed out that Chapelcross is frequently audited. Cllr Dryburgh asked T Godley if the NDA were ever audited, and by whom. T Godley confirmed that this was indeed the case and regular audits were carried out by BERR as well as the National Audit Office.

Separation of Magnox North and South

J Rogerson asked for an update with regard to the legal separation of Magnox North and Magnox South. D Wilson responded by advising that there were issues regarding legal licences and that the separation was still outstanding, however it was hoped that this would be completed by 1st October 2008.

Funding

Cllr Ogilvie raised the issue of funding being given on an annual basis, and pointed out that it was very difficult to plan ahead when there was so much uncertainty. T Godley advised that the figures for Chapelcross were included in the business plan and would be going forward. R Flynn pointed out that there was a proposal for a 3 year business strategy, it would be included in the new plan and consultation of this would be in November. E Gray confirmed that government funding works in 3 year cycles but recognised that the NDA are looking at longer term issues. Cllr Marshall raised the local perspective that although we had a three year plan this was effectively year by year on budget. Cllr Marshall stated that it would be beneficial for the SSG to see a 3 year cycle to help stabilise the local economy and help remove uncertainty. E Gray stated that she is regularly attending meetings and this was a repeating request. D Wilson commented that although funding is very difficult to control that both defuelling and asbestos projects were well underway and delivery was being met.

The Chair thanked T Godley for his presentation and information provided.

7. NDA Property Management Presentation

Tony Smithers introduced himself and passed apologies for David Atkinson who was unable to attend. T Smithers updated the group with regard to the expressions of interest in purchasing land assets from the NDA. To date 60 had been received from many varied sources. T Smithers confirmed that all were being given due consideration. The NDA are carefully managing the fundamental balance of expressions of interest and the need for decommissioning and that there has been an Independent Property Manager appointed, Andrew Slaney, to identify what sites would need when considering expressions of interest.

T Smithers explained that disposals would follow due process and that Critchell Downs Law would be taken into account. An explanation of Critchell Downs was given: law which dictates that following compulsory purchase that in the event of the asset being sold that the first offer had to be the historic owner. T Smithers reported that many difficulties were faced in trying to trace historic owners however; due process was being followed on all UK sites. T Smithers reported that specific Chapelcross issues were being addressed at a meeting in Manchester scheduled for the 16th October with regard to proposals both on and around the land at Chapelcross and confirmed that these were still expressions of interest. An example was given with regard to Warmanbie Pumping Station – T Smithers stated that it would be likely that if the land at Chapelcross were to be redeveloped with industrial usage then more than likely a water supply would be required – and it would therefore be important to retain the infrastructure to provide water ie Warmanbie Pumping Station, however maintenance would be required and there would have to be a collective view taken with regard to funding. In response to this example Cllr Dryburgh believed that Scottish Government will change and nuclear rebuild will occur, water will be needed at Chapelcross. Cllr Ogilvie reported that many fishermen and members of the public used the area around Warmanbie and highlighted the need for this area to be maintained. Tony Smithers confirmed that the Site Licence Company is currently responsible for the maintenance of this. Cllr Marshall reported that there was much history surrounding Warmanbie Pumping Station and Milnbie Wier and it would be appropriate to establish a register to address risk/issues with the many local issues that would need to be considered. W McNairn also stated that many local people would rather see the removal of Warmanbie than see development of the Chapelcross Site into a coal fired power station. W McNairn also requested the NDA

to keep local people in the loop with regard to these issues. T Smithers acknowledged the need for consultation with regard to all of these issues. L Moore stated he was pleased to note that the land would be offered to individuals in the first instance. However, he also commented that although the discussion had revolved around industrial rebuild he felt that some areas should be dedicated to green field and this should be taken into consideration when addressing expressions of interest.

L Moore requested further information regarding land available with regard to expression of interest and it was confirmed that these were available on the NDA website. www.nda.com. **ACTION – Keith Riding to provide hard copies of maps detailing NDA land on and around Chapelcross at next SSG Meeting.**

T Smithers stated any questions re expressions of interest would be welcomed and contact details are available through the SSG Secretariat.

J Rogerson asked; Are the NDA looking at only the licenced site or the whole site? T Smithers responded by confirming that both licenced and non licenced sites were being considered. Although it is the NDA's primary objective to decommission the site they were also considering further use later

The Chair thanked T Smithers for his presentation.

Other Reports from SSG Bodies

NII

Les Davies referred to the NII Site Inspector Quarterly Report which has been circulated with the previous minutes. There were no questions relating to this report. Cllr Ogilvie asked for an update with regard to the Safety Review taking place. L Davies advised that this was due the end of August. D Wilson added that there were items outstanding from INSA (Independent Nuclear Safety Assessor) and the NSC (Nuclear Safety Committee) which would be addressed over the coming fortnight.

D&G Constabulary

Inspector David Irving from Dumfries & Galloway Constabulary confirmed that they would be involved at the forthcoming emergency exercise.

Scottish Government

E Gray from Scottish Government reported on the exemption order review with regard to asbestos and tritium and advised that this was still ongoing. There were issues in terms of legislation which may differ between English and Welsh legislation. Cllr Ogilvie confirmed that there will be representation attending the next National Stakeholder's Group (NSG) Scheduled to take place on 4th November 2008.

8. Chapelcross Sub Groups Update

Socio-Economic

Paul Giles updated the SSG with regard to the governance arrangements being put in place to allow the CoReS Group and the SSG Socio Economic Sub Group to meet to allow dissolution of the Sub Group and put in place new governing arrangements.

Paul Giles referred to the bid proposals submitted in June which are still outstanding. These have now been passed to BERR (Business Enterprise and Regulatory Reform) for further comment. It was acknowledged by the SSG that the group were optimistic with regard to the proposals and look forward to receiving a response from the NDA. It was noted that there are three outstanding proposals: *Solway Shellfish & Research Ltd*, *Annandale and Eskdale Council for Voluntary Services – Design for Life*. *Annan Bruce Statue Project*, which would be determined by the new governing body, once this is in place.

Cllr Ogilvie advised the SSG that there has recently been appointed a Economic Development Officer for Annandale and Eskdale and questioned whether she should be involved in the newly formed Socio Economic Group. Sean Marshall commented that whilst Chapelcross would be the catalyst of the

Socio Economic Group the SSG would still implement a gating procedure before requests would be submitted to the NDA and that final endorsements on NDA funding would still go through the SSG.

Chair Lindsay endorsed that the SSG acknowledged the amount of hard work had been put into the Socio Economic proposals.

Community Support

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall - details attached to previous Minutes.

Education Support

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall. No Education Sub Group Meetings had been held due to the absence of Janice Rough.

10. SSG Constitution Review

Following all members being issued with a copy of the NDA consultation there have consequently been several meetings held with regard to the SSG Constitution Review. A draft copy of the SSG Constitution has been issued to all members for comment (any feedback is most welcome to jill.m.callander@magnoxnorthsites.com). Sean Marshall reported that the SSG Constitution document was work in progress and also encouraged any feedback, which would be addressed at the November SSG Meeting.

L Moore reported that there was concern regarding the fact that the Federation of Community Councils was not included in the proposals and expressed that this was unacceptable. It was noted that the review suggested a representative from each of the three bordering Community Councils, Eaglesfield & Kirtlebridge, Royal Burgh of Annan and Eastriggs, Dornock and Creca. Sean Marshall stated that the proposals intention was to increase the current Community Council representation. However, due to the comments by L Moore, it may be more appropriate if the Federation were to nominate the agreed number of representatives from Community Councils.

Cllr Brodie stated that he felt that a political balance as needed and suggested one representative from each political party, giving influence with regard to Scottish Government issues. Cllr Marshall responded and advised that most SSGs do not have MPs or MSPs as voting members.

Cllr Ogilvie asked if the Constitution was site specific but encompassed the NDA Guidelines and Sean Marshall confirmed that this was indeed the case. Cllr Ogilvie commented that there had been very many positives gained in the move from Local Liaison Committee to Site Stakeholder Group but there was the risk of the members numbers becoming too large.

The position with regard to the SSG Constitution will be addressed at the next SSG Meeting scheduled on 28th November 2008.

12. AOB

D Wilson reported that David Orr, who previously represented Scottish Environment Protection Agency(SEPA) is now working at Chapelcross and the new SEPA representative for the Site is Hugh Fearn, Mr Fearn is planning to attend the next SSG Meeting in December.

Cllr Ogilvie congratulated Chair Ian Lindsay on his handling of the meeting yet again and commented that although a delay had been incurred due to Cllr Graham being trapped in the lift, the Meeting had run to schedule and finished on time. This was wholeheartedly agreed by the Group.

13. Date of Next Meeting – Friday 28 November 2008 at 10am, Annan Council Chambers Annan.