



## Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

### Minutes of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group held on Friday 28 November 2008 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan

**In Attendance:** Cllr Ian Lindsay (representing Annandale East) (Chair)  
Avril Campbell (SSG Secretary)  
Dave Wilson (Chapelcross Site Director)  
Cllr Sean Marshall (representing Annandale South)  
Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie (representing Annandale South)  
Cllr Archie Dryburgh (representing Annandale East)  
Cllr Len Moore (Federation of Community Councils)  
Nick Woodcock (Chapelcross Deputy Site Director)  
Keith Riding (NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager)  
Jonathan Jenkin (NDA Socio Economic Manager)  
Cllr Ian Carruthers  
Cllr Gail MacGregor (representing Annandale North)  
Murray Bainbridge (Scottish Enterprise D&G)  
Steve Southam (D&G Council)  
Cllr Richard Brodie (representing Annandale South)  
Cllr Allan Graham (representing Annandale East)  
Dr Elaine Murray – MSP

**Apologies:** Jill Callander (SSG Secretary)  
Cllr Michael Dickie (representing Annandale North)  
Hugh Fearn (SEPA)  
Les Davies (NIL)  
John Riddet (Rural Payments & Inspections Directorate)  
David Mundell – MP  
David Gurney (Civil Protection and Emergency Planning)  
Cllr Ted Brown (representing Annandale North)  
Cllr Roger Grant (representing Annandale North)  
Marianne Cook (Scottish Government)  
David Irving & Robert Gibson (D&G Constabulary)  
Neil Erskine (D&G Fire and Rescue Services)  
Paul Giles (Chapelcross Transition Manager)  
Pam Duerden (Chapelcross ESS&Q Manager)

**Present:**

Walter Kennedy (Magnox North)  
Willie McNairn (Blackhills Farm)  
Chris Brown (D&G Economic Regeneration)  
Abbey Rogerson (Annandale Observer)

Sharon Liptrot (D&G Standard)  
David Lessels (Solway Shellfish Research Ltd)  
Andrew Patterson (Solway Shellfish Research Ltd)

### 1. Chairman's Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the November meeting of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group. Cllr Sean Marshall added that after the SSG meeting there was to be a presentation ceremony by Dr Elaine Murray MSP to the six Chapelcross candidates who had successfully completed their SVQ qualification in Nuclear Decommissioning.

## **2. Announcement and Apologies**

The Secretary gave the apologies as listed above.

## **3. Minutes of the meeting held on Friday 5<sup>th</sup> September 2008**

The minutes were endorsed by Cllr R Ogilvie and seconded by Cllr Marshall

### **Matters arising from the minutes**

Willie McNairn told the Chair that at the last SSG meeting, Richard Flynn, NDA had given him a website to access the NDA Socio-economic policy and responses, but that this page could not be accessed. He confirmed that he still wanted to see the submissions as promised.

**ACTION:** *Jonathan Jenkin will resolve the problem of the NDA web access.*

- K Riding to report on the outcome of S3 findings – to be covered in his report.
- K Riding to provide hard copies of maps detailing NDA land on and around Chapelcross. – copies were handed out to the members.

## **4. Chapelcross Site Director's Report**

Dave Wilson presented his report using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes).

He ended by summarising that the start of defuelling at Chapelcross was a major achievement, the asbestos removal project was going very well and the containment programme was progressing well with a highly visible change to the skyline over Chapelcross.

### **Questions and Observations**

#### **Defuelling**

Chair Ian Lindsay queried the frustration with the workforce as written in one of the site's Weekly Briefs. Dave Wilson replied that this was the result of work on Reactor 3 which had been planned and hadn't taken place. He explained that personnel are focussed and want to get the work done.

Cllr Ogilvie referred to Dave's comments on Contractor's statistics and to the accident at Sellafield and asked if there were any lessons to be learnt on control and supervision at Chapelcross. Dave Wilson explained that a review on control & supervision at Chapelcross had been done and it was decided that Chapelcross supervisors and managers were required to focus on more quality supervision.

Cllr Dryburgh commented that Calder Hall personnel had visited Chapelcross and from feedback it was discovered that at Calder there was only one engineer working on the Fuel Route who was an agency supply worker. He asked if there was any possibility of Chapelcross helping Calder Hall by sharing the work if they needed it. Dave Wilson answered that Chapelcross will support them in going forward, as Calder Hall and Chapelcross had the same reactors and fuel route. Keith Riding added that as far as the NDA was concerned, they would want the cross fertilisation of information and good work experience between the SLC sites and would be monitoring this very closely over the next few years.

Willie Nairn told the Chair that the site siren had gone off twice in October and he had tried to call the site to ask why. It had also gone off in November. He advised that people should be aware when the siren was to be sounded. The Chair commented that it was important that the public are notified when the siren is going to be sounded unnecessarily and he would discuss this matter with the Site Director.

## **5. NDA Chapelcross Site Programme Manager's Report**

Keith Riding presented this report using the attached presentation slides (see copy attached to Minutes) and welcomed Jonathan Jenkin in his new role as NDA Socio-Economic Manager for this area.

After his presentation, Keith handed over to Jonathan for his update on the Socio-Economics.

## Questions & Observations

The Chair made reference to Keith's comment on NDA Communications being strong and effective. He added that this did not appear to be the case as there had been no communication as to the result of the five funding applications submissions which were submitted in March 2008. He expressed that the SSG Secretariat should have been informed of the progress and added that Elizabeth Gray from the Scottish Government had also wanted to be kept in the loop. Jonathan explained that Bob Churchill had submitted two of the funding requests (Chapelcross Business Park and Business Incubation Centre) to the Department of Environment & Climate Change (DECC) this week as top priority and the result should be known within the next month.

Sean Marshall explained that he was aware that on the matter of the other three applications, the supply chain support programme and GLA Community Fund were still being considered but would require further discussions with the NDA, and the Business liaison officer application had been rejected.

Murray Bainbridge explained that to support his business case for the two projects below, he had to demonstrate the cost and where funding had come from and what the income associated with it. He gave a brief of his submission to Bob Churchill as follows:

- CX Business Industry Park – Request of £1.5 million from the NDA, match funding from the property vehicle Katalyst projects £1.5 million plus £294,000 for valuation of 18 acres of land.
- Business Incubation Centre – estimated total cost to build 2.5million; £1million from private sector, half million from other public funding (anticipate European Funding) and £1million from the NDA

Cllr Ogilvie asked how these 2 proposals were looking. Jonathan replied that feedback was very positive. The Chair added that he was disappointed that there had been no feedback or communication on the subject.

Cllr Dryburgh stated that some of Sellafeld's funding had been returned to the NDA. Keith Riding explained that there would be an opportunity to use this funding within this financial year. Cllr Dryburgh asked that even although there was no lead site, this should not stop any cost saving activities. Keith explained that innovation can introduce additional scope.

Cllr Ogilvie asked about the graphite issue – if there was no solution to the storage of it, could the graphite be left where it is? Keith Riding explained that the Japanese were looking at incineration but the capture of the Carbon 14 was a problem. At present they could not move forward on a decision.

Cllr Ogilvie then asked about above ground storage of waste. He added that he was looking at the longevity of jobs and that the site is safely decommissioned. Keith Riding advised that they had had no clear direction from the Scottish Government on this and therefore no decision can be made. A safe, secure state cannot be decided at the moment. Cllr Ogilvie added that although the Scottish Government option is cheaper, the impact on local people was the problem. Keith explained that above ground storage may not be cheaper as the storage facilities would need to be replaced. Perhaps with innovation there may be a resolution of the situation for the future.

With reference to the Community Fund, Cllr Ogilvie asked who the NDA were to have dialogue with. Cllr Marshall replied that the original application was submitted via the SSG Socio-Economic sub group, but due to recent changes the ongoing dialogue would now be with CoRes. He also gave background information on two points

1. At the NSG meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> November there was a detailed presentation on safe secure sites, that posed a worrying scenario that by 2015, the 10 sites could each have only 85 people left, with a corporate centre of approximately 200 personnel. This would require an increase on funding for it to happen, but would have a major adverse impact on the local economy.
2. Chapelcross SSG has already advised that it was keen on early site clearance. This is an opportunity for Chapelcross to campaign for early site clearance for economic and environmental advantages. There was also the issue of the Scottish Government's consultation on the storage of higher activity waste.

Willie Nairn asked if the route was still open for waste to be sent to Sellafeld or will there be a store at Chapelcross. Dave Wilson advised that the fuel would be sent to Sellafeld. Keith Riding added that this is as far as we know and that this was fluid until the Scottish Government define a clear policy. Dave Wilson added that SEPA had been on site to review this waste route process.

Cllr Ogilvie mentioned that the heavy traffic was damaging the local roads. He asked if someone was going to invest on repairs. Cllr Marshall answered that the Council may take this up through Combined Services. Keith Riding added that it would be view of the NDA that the road & transport authorities who would be responsible for this.

## **6. Update from the NDA NSG and Scottish Site Meetings**

### ***NDA National Stakeholder Group***

Cllr Dryburgh explained that the NSG meeting gave the opportunity to look at six specific issues; communications; stakeholder engagement; land quality management; people plan lead by Jim McLauchlan the new NDA HR Manager; non NDA liability session; asset organisation

Cllr Marshall added that the SSG Chairs of the 19 sites had a meeting before the NSG where they met Bill Hamilton. Discussions included SSG guidance and stakeholder management. It was revealed that the NDA were looking to employ 3 socio-economic managers to concentrate on the four priority areas, Dounreay, Sellafield, North Wales and Gretna/Lockerbie/Annan (GLA). This arrangement would give a more streamlined process in any future funding applications. He added that in his opinion overall there was an improvement on the NSG meeting.

### ***Scottish Sites***

Cllr Ogilvie commented that the Scottish Site Meeting was very useful. It had been chaired by Elizabeth Gray who was very enthusiastic.

Cllr Marshall added that they had been given an action from that meeting. The Chair and Cllr Dryburgh agreed that it would be a good idea.

**ACTION:** *Archie Dryburgh / SSG Secretary to arrange a presentation from the Nuclear Skills Academy Scotland for a future meeting*

The Chair asked if there was a possibility of sharing waste routes with other energy producers in Scotland. Dave Wilson said that there were a lot of good ideas in place to share business waste streams.

## **7. Other Reports from SSG Bodies**

### **NII**

The Chair referred to the NII Site Inspector Quarterly Report which had been circulated with the previous minutes. There were no questions relating to this report.

Murray Bainbridge gave a presentation on the Economic Impact Assessment of Early Site Clearance at Chapelcross using the attached presentation slides. He explained that information had been taken from the current Chapelcross Lifetime Plan and the NDA draft Business Plan. He summarised - if Chapelcross was adopted as the lead site in decommissioning, the NDA would have an opportunity to demonstrate their stakeholder commitments.

Cllr Ogilvie stated that this plan was a useful building block in the way forward.

The Chair thanked Murray for his in depth presentation and asked the members to ratify this plan. The plan was ratified by the SSG Members.

## **8. Role and Remit of CoRes Group**

Steve Southam commented on the wording on the CoRes paper and asked the SSG to adopt the revised role and remit within this new document. It was agreed by the SSG. Steve also asked for a SSG representative to be a member of the CoRes group. It was agreed that the Chair would represent the SSG.

## **9. Chapelcross Sub Groups Update**

### **Socio-Economic**

Cllr Marshall recorded the good work of the Socio-Economic sub-group but advised that the sub-group is now recommending that future NDA submissions and therefore sub-group work were to be passed to CoRes as the same work was more or less being done by the two groups. This was covered in the new CoReS remit previously discussed. He added that CoRes would make sure that the SSG was included in any media coverage with regard to the Business Park and Incubation Centre projects and in the future the the full SSG would have to ratify at it's quarterly meetings any proposals which came forward for NDA socio economic funding.

Cllr Ogilvie asked if the SSG would we get a regular update on what the CoRes group were doing? Cllr Marshall and the Chair agreed that they would raise this issue with CoRes. Len Moore agreed that CoRes should provide an informative and detailed update advising where the money is coming from and what the timescales are.

Cllr MacGregor said that she had no idea of what CoRes did and added that they should be more transparent. Cllr Dryburgh endorsed her statement and asked for an update on information on the CoRes administration at the next SSG meeting.

**ACTION:** *Steve Southam to give update on CoRes administration*

The Chair added that the SSG has the important role of making sure that money goes to the right place.

### **Community Support**

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall - details attached to previous Minutes.

### **Education Support**

Verbal update given by Cllr Marshall. He said that there was £17,000 remaining in the budget and added that every Primary and Secondary School in Annandale & Eskdale had recently been offered the chance to apply for funding (£500 for Primary, £1000 for Secondary) for a Science, Enterprise or Environment (SEE) themed project. An update on the progress would be given at the next SSG meeting in March.

Cllr Ogilvie asked if there would be an Education Representative at the SSG in the future. Sean Marshall replied that this was currently being looked at under the SSG Constitution review which covers representation.

## **10. SSG Constitution Review**

Cllr Marshall advised that because the NDA had not finalised the review of the SSG Final Guidance, the current work we have done on the draft Chapelcross SSG constitution had been identified as a best practice example and was being circulated around the other nineteen sites. The Chair recorded his thanks to Steve Southam, Julie Douglas from D&G Council for their support and guidance up to now on putting the draft Constitution together. The final draft of the Chapelcross SSG Constitution would be brought to a future meeting to be adopted and any amendments would have to be decided by a vote. Len Moore gave feedback on the representative preferences proposed by Annandale & Eskdale Federation of Community Councils and it was suggested that these be taken into consideration.

## **11. NDA Draft Business Plan**

The Chair stated that the draft NDA Business Plan 2009/12 is out for consultation was similar to current Business Plan 2008/11 but was concerned that the NDA seemed to be moving further away from the idea of identifying a lead site for early decommissioning. As this was an identified priority for the SSG members it was agreed that support for Chapelcross being chosen as the lead site should be included in the representation put forward by the Chapelcross SSG. Cllr Marshall added that the draft Plan is also on the NDA website and each member could make a representation electronically if they so wish. Cllrs Ogilvie and MacGregor requested a hard copy.

**ACTION:** *SSG secretary to send hard copies of the NDA Business Plan to SSG Members*

## **12. AOB and Public Forum**

David Lessels asked if his application had been endorsed by the SSG and sent to the NDA. Cllr Marshall advised that it had been passed to the CoRes Group. Steve Southam explained that the group was still waiting for feedback from the NDA on current applications and his application would be looked at sometime in the new year by CoRes. Any projects recommended for approval would come back to the SSG for endorsement.

The dates for the 2009 SSG meetings were proposed as being held on Friday 6<sup>th</sup> March, Friday 12<sup>th</sup> June, Friday 4<sup>th</sup> September and Friday 4<sup>th</sup> December. The Chair asked if there was any preference for evening meetings in the summer months as it had been previously. It was decided that the group would look at diary entries and the summer dates/times would be discussed at the next meeting in March.

## **13. Date of Next Meeting – Friday 6th March 2009 at 10am, Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall.**

Cllr Ogilvie commended the Chair on a very good meeting with a lot of interesting discussion and debate..