



Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

Minutes of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group held on Wednesday 6th September 2006 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan.

In Attendance: Cllr Ian Lindsay (Chair)
Avril Mitchell (Secretary)
Cllr Sean Marshall
Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie
Cllr Chris Carruthers
Cllr Michael Dickie
Cllr Lavinia Vaughan
Len Moore (Federation of Community Councils)
Isabelle Watson (S.E.P.A.)
Mike Travis (Chapelcross Site Manager)
Dave Wilson (Project Delivery Manager, Chapelcross)
Alastair Laird (Chapelcross Commercial Manager)
Steve Southam (Dumfries & Galloway Council)
Robert Gibson (Emergency Planning D&G Constabulary)
John Rogerson (Chapelcross)
Randall Bargelt (Chapelcross Site Programme Manager - NDA)
Les Davies (Chapelcross Site Inspector - NII)
Paul Allan (Creca Hall Chairperson)
Janice Rough (D&G Education Officer)

Apologies: Billy McVinnie (D & G Fire Brigade)
Ashley Smallwood (Scottish Enterprise D & G)
Cllr Marjorie McQueen
Cllr Allan Graham
Cllr Tony Turner
Cllr Wilma Paterson
Insp Alan Hill (Chapelcross Civil Nuclear Constabulary)
Mike Coward (Emergency Planning Cumbria Council)

Present:

Elizabeth Gray (Scottish Executive)	Tony Trayner (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Philip Jones (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)	Alistair K Smith (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Tony Bale (British Nuclear Group, Hunterston 'A')	Archie Dryburgh (T & G District Committee)
Paul Giles (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)	Sandra Jack (Scottish Executive)
Janet Brunton (Scottish Executive)	June Love (UKAEA, Dounreay)
Derrick Milnes (Dounreay SSG)	Kenneth MacDougall (Hunterston 'A' SSG)
Bill Hamilton (NDA)	Charles Rives (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Neil MacIntyre (Annan County Council)	Fergie Bell (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)
John Lawes (NDA)	Fiona Robertson (NDA)
Andy Feltham (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)	John Robertson (Hunterston 'A' SSG)
John G Lamb (Hunterston 'A' SSG)	Jennifer Gillie (Hunterston 'A' SSG)
Kate Shannon (Annadale Observer Newspaper)	Alyson Russell-Stevenson (British Nuclear Group, Hunterston 'A')
Cllr Wilkinson (Hunterston 'A' SSG Chairman)	Angus Cochrane-Patrick (Hunterston 'A' SSG)
Pam Frame (Hunterston 'A' SSG)	

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the September meeting of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group. He introduced Elizabeth Gray, Head of Radioactive Waste, Scottish Executive and welcomed the SSG representatives from Hunterston 'A' and Dounreay.

2. Announcement and Apologies

The Secretary gave apologies as listed above.

3. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 7th June 2006

The Minutes were proposed by Cllr Ogilvie and seconded by Cllr Carruthers. The Chairman referred to the Actions arising from this meeting.

4. Matters arising from the minutes.

ACTIONS from the last meeting:

Robert Gibson – debrief on Emergency Exercise Zena. Robert explained that this report is now in the public domain and can be distributed if desired. **Completed**

Mike Travis – Cooling Tower demolition presentation to be delivered at the meeting. **Completed**

Randall Bargelt – End State documents and socio-economic goals. Draft consultation document will be out in October 2006. **Completed**

SSG Secretary – Invitation sent out and site tour will be conducted the next day. **Completed**

5. Chapelcross Site Manager's Report

Mike Travis referred to and gave an update on, his quarterly report using the attached presentation slides. (*appendix 1*)

Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie congratulated Chapelcross on receiving the Scottish Executive 'Determined to Succeed' award. He also commented that due to the NDA strategy, the new recruitment scheme at Chapelcross had given Annan and the surrounding area a welcome lift.

6. Cooling Tower Demolition – Dave Wilson

Dave Wilson gave a detailed description on how the Cooling Towers were to be demolished. He referred to the extensive tendering process for choosing the contractor of choice to do the work, the safety concerns involved and the effect the Cooling Tower demolition would have in the local community. Chairman Ian Lindsay asked if there would be a problem with dust release and weather conditions. Dave answered by saying that dust was a potential hazard but no greater than any other demolition process. From a radiological point of view, there was no contamination present in the concrete samples. He continued by saying that only foggy conditions would stop the demolition process.

Cllr Len Moore asked how long it would take to implode the Towers. Dave explained that it would all be over in about 10 seconds.

Steve Southam stressed that he was very impressed with the time that Chapelcross had allocated to this project and also the very stringent safety aspects connected with it. He added that the Cooling Towers were a valued landmark to the region and he was pleased that there was to be a continuity of a replacement landmark at Gretna funded by the NDA.

Cllr Sean Marshall asked if there would be any effect from the vibration from the demolition with surrounding properties neighbouring the site. Dave Wilson explained that according to the advice from the vibration consultant on site, it would have very little effect on the Reactors or buildings on Site and therefore should have no effect to properties near the site.

Cllr Sean Marshall asked who would be 'pushing the button'.

Dave replied by saying that the demolition company would be doing it because of the safety and technical issues concerned with the project.

7. Presentation by Elizabeth Gray, Scottish Executive

Elizabeth Gray introduced herself as the Head of the Radioactive Waste Team for the Scottish executive and gave reference to her presentation slides. She gave a brief overview of the range of activities and community involvement that the Scottish Executive was responsible for. She explained that the Scottish Executive and the NDA had the same responsibilities, functions and duties but it was the Scottish Parliament who was responsible for Radioactive Waste Management. She explained that the Scottish Forum had been created as Scottish law differed to that of the English law.

Cllr Sean Marshall referred to the Scottish Forum slide and explained that every nuclear site had unique situations in each area. The Forum would enable all sites to work together and hear each others views. Elizabeth Gray added that she was heartened by the last two meetings which enhanced the communication between the sites and to hear the views of the various Site Stakeholder Groups

8. Presentation on Site End States – Randall Bargelt, NDA

With reference to the Site End State Definition Process document, Randall started by quoting that ‘the definition of a project is a beginning and an end’. He advised that after the consultation process, the information must be pulled together and the NDA will come up with something that is feasible and achievable. The Site will be cleaned up to the standard at which the public choose. He explained the consultation process was most important where unbiased opinions must be given by local stakeholders. He added that the NDA was there as a support to the Chapelcross Site / SLC but it was the SSG who was leading the decisions to be made and the End State would develop with SSG input. He concluded by saying that all SSG and Site Licenced Company (SLC) inputs had to be submitted by March 2007.

9. Other reports from SSG Bodies

SEPA- Isabelle Watson

Isabelle Watson started by saying that she had been on site a couple of times since the last SSG meeting and gave a general update of her activities. She advised that there was nothing of significance to report and added that Chapelcross kept SEPA up to date with their activities.

NII – Les Davies

Les Davies had nothing to comment but was happy to take any questions. There were no questions.

NDA - Randall Bargelt

Cllr Sean Marshall referred to the Socio Economic guidelines for the October 2006 consultation and asked Randall how long the consultation period would be.

Randall replied that Karen Dickens was dealing with this document and that he would source a reply for the next meeting. **ACTION:** Randall Bargelt – How long the consultation process will be

Dumfries & Galloway Constabulary – Robert Gibson

Mr Gibson advised that they were to be involved in a security exercise at Chapelcross the next day which was follow on from last year’s exercise.

10. Chapelcross SSG Sub-Groups update

Several SSG Sub-Group meetings had taken place since the last SSG meeting, and the appropriate minutes of the Sub-Groups had been circulated to members. Chairman asked for endorsement of the decisions made at these meetings

Socio-Economic

- Minutes from two meetings on the 9th January 2006 and 1st March 2006
- Endorsement of criteria for the development of social projects for the 2006/2007 NDA fund.

- Action from the 3rd meeting on the 18th August – minutes have not yet been agreed by Sub-Group members.

Steve Southam explained that as the NDA Socio-economic draft guidelines would not be published till October 2006, he had drawn up draft local criteria for the development of social projects to go public, subject to SSG approval. This criteria would enable the sub-group to sort out the processing and would evolve from the NDA criteria which will come later on. He asked the SSG to approve them; asked for a dedicated Sub-group to carry the processes forward and asked the subgroup to update the guidance using good practice to be taken to the NDA.

Randall Bargelt said that he had no problem with the criteria. Cllr Sean Marshall commented that by using this criteria the Sub-group would have the power to work up bids for 2006/2007.

The criteria was endorsed by Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie and seconded by Cllr Sean Marshall. The minutes for both minutes were endorsed by the SSG.

Community Support

- Minutes from five meetings held on 31st March; 25th May; 23rd June; 28th July and 25th August 2006

Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie said that even the small amounts which had been requested meant a lot to local groups. Cllr Marshall added that the system was working well and there had been over 40 applications which had received awards so far. The Chairman requested that although the NDA prefer requests for larger amounts, he hoped they would consider allowing sites to continue supporting smaller schemes from their site community support budget.

The minutes of all five meetings were endorsed by the SSG

Education Support

- Minutes from four meetings held on 24th May; 22nd June; 21st July and 18th August 2006.

Janice stressed the importance of the Site End State consultation process by involving young people. A project called Space Unlimited has been considered using external consultants who will give the children's view and come up with innovative solutions with no pressure or adult help. The initial school would be Lockerbie Academy

The minutes were endorsed by the SSG

Site End States

- Reference to the 1st meeting at 6pm
- Newly appointed chairman to refer to this first meeting

Paul Allan introduced himself as the Sub-group chairman. He explained that there was a very busy programme to meet the targets. He explained that 11 companies had been invited to tender with the objective of providing good consultation support opportunities at Chapelcross. The successful company needed to plan the best way forward to suit the economic situation that Chapelcross was in and put forward the aspirations of the local communities.

Review of Constitution

The Chairman reported that they were still reviewing the Constitution and identifying best practice.

Randall Bargelt advised that it was important to have something in place that everybody understands. The Chairman replied that it would suit all eventualities.

11. Chairman's Comments – Hunterston 'A' and Dounreay SSG's

Hunterston 'A' Chairman Cllr Wilkinson commented that he had enjoyed the Chapelcross SSG meeting and was very impressed by the way in which the Sub-Groups were handled. He felt that it was good to listen and learn from each other. He continued by giving a short description on how the Hunterston SSG was run and the progress that they had made. He ended by stating that it was good that these meetings were open and transparent and invited both Chapelcross and Dounreay to attend their next SSG meeting.

The Chapelcross Chairman Cllr Ian Lindsay, replied that they would take up his invitation.

Dounreay SSG member John Deighan, TGWU representative, announced that he had learned a lot from attending the Chapelcross SSG. He felt that the Trade Unions have an important part to play in any decisions to be made regarding the Dounreay Site as it was the major employer in the North of Scotland. He added that the Dounreay SSG was making good progress.

Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie remarked that the Dounreay SSG did not use Powerpoint Presentations at their meetings. He asked John what he thought of the Chapelcross presentation.

John answered that he thought that the CX SSG was timed well but they found that the presentations at Dounreay were too long and that there wasn't enough time for discussion.

Cllr Sean Marshall commented that he hoped that Chapelcross SSG could help the socio economic situation at Dounreay by sharing best practice.

Chairman Cllr Ian Lindsay added that Dounreay had a far bigger socio economic problem with the loss of jobs for approx 2,500 people.

12. Date of next meeting

Friday 1st December 2006 at 10:00am in the Council Chambers Annan. There may also be a specially convened SSG meeting, prior to this, combining the progress of the Cooling Tower Demolition and consultation on Site end states, if deemed necessary.

13. Any Other Business

No other business.

The chairman invited any questions from the public.

Archie Dryburgh asked Elizabeth Gray if the Scottish Executive had consulted with other organisations such as hospitals and universities. Elizabeth replied by saying that it was the Scottish Executive who recognised that it was not just the Nuclear industry who had a problem with Low Level Waste and had consulted with hospitals, universities, educational establishments and the oil industry. So the answer was yes.

Angus Cochrane-Patrick from Hunterston SSG referred to the transfer of waste from Chapelcross to Hunterston and asked if anyone could give details on this possible project. Randall replied by saying that they are in discussion stages only and that there had been no meetings yet. Angus asked if there needed to be Scottish Executive approval before there was any movement of waste. Elizabeth said that there was a requirement for ILW storage but there needs to be open discussions before any decisions could be made. She added that the NDA were accountable to the Scottish Executive ministers with proof that there had been proper consultation.

Kenny MacDougall from Hunterston repeated the question – 'are NDA planning to move waste from Chapelcross to Hunterston'? Randall replied that they are looking at options but there was no plan and no budget for this. Elizabeth added that waste issue was being looked at again by CORWM as part of the NDA set up and some decisions have to be made about building for storage. Hunterston may be one but there are others. Mike Travis explained that the Chapelcross Life Cycle Baseline Plan (LCBL) includes construction for waste but there is no plan to ship anything to Hunterston. There is a plan to ship Low Level Waste (LLW) to the repository near to Drigg and the Intermediate Level Waste (ILW) to Sellafield.

There were no other questions and the Chairman rounded up the meeting by thanking everyone who had attended.