



## Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

### Minutes of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group held on Friday 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2007 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan.

**In Attendance:** Cllr Ian Lindsay (Chair)  
Lindsey Kyle (Secretary)  
Cllr Sean Marshall  
Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie  
Cllr Allan Graham  
Len Moore (Federation of Community Councils)  
David Orr (S.E.P.A.)  
Mike Travis (Chapelcross Site Manager)  
Dave Wilson (Project Delivery Manager, Chapelcross)  
Alastair Laird (Chapelcross Commercial Manager)  
Sgt David Irving (Emergency Planning D&G Constabulary)  
Stuart Chalmers (- NDA)  
Les Davies (Chapelcross Site Inspector - NII)  
Elizabeth Gray (Scottish Executive)  
Paul Allan (Creca Hall Chairperson)  
Elaine Murray MSP  
David Byers (Scottish Enterprise D & G)  
Janice Rough (D&G Education Officer)

**Apologies:** John Rogerson (Trade Union convenor)  
Cllr Chris Carruthers  
Cllr Tony Turner  
Cllr Michael Dickie  
Mr M Coward (Cumbria County Emergency Planning Officer)  
Cllr Wilma Paterson

**Present:**

Debbie Cairns (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)	Tony Trayner (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Stewart Wilson (D&G Constabulary)	Philip Jones (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Frank McGowan (Annan Community Council)	Alan Hill (Civil Nuclear Constabulary)
Richard Murray (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)	Charles Rives (British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross)
Richard Robertson (Scottish Executive)	Bob Cuthbertson (Scottish Executive)
Peter Brown (Scottish Executive)	Richard Grant (Scottish Executive)
Fraser Robertson (Annandale Observer Newspaper)	Sharon Liptrott (D&G Standard)
David Collier (Falkland Associates)	Steve Southam (D & G Council)
Willie McNairn (Blackhills Farm)	Helen McNairn (Blackhills Farm)
John Wallace	Betty Codona

## **1. Chairman's Opening Remarks**

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the March meeting of the Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group. He asked for all mobile phones to be on silent and gave details on emergency fire procedures.

## **2. Announcement and Apologies**

The Secretary gave apologies as listed above. The Chairman announced that David Byers of Scottish Enterprise would be officially replacing Ashley Spence as an SSG member as she had left the organisation. David Gurney, Emergency Planning Manager at Dumfries & Galloway Council introduced himself and explained that he would be officially replacing Maureen Course as an SSG member.

## **3. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 1<sup>st</sup> December 2006**

The Minutes were proposed by Cllr Ogilvie and seconded by Cllr Marshall. The Chairman referred to the Actions arising from this meeting.

## **4. Matters arising from the minutes.**

### **ACTIONS from the last meeting:**

Bridge House – The Chairman raised the fact that in the last minutes Cllr Turner raised the issue of Bridge House and when will the project will be approved? The Chairman explained that Stuart Chalmers of the NDA would pick this up later in the agenda.

Richard Murray had two actions and in response to the first action he confirmed that presentations will be carried out to Stakeholders on a regular basis e.g. Community Council on 12<sup>th</sup> March.

In relation to the question about limescale entering the food chain Richard said that the likely event of fish eating limescale is virtually nil but BNG do report on the amount of activity in the food chain annually and the Food Standards Agency also reports on this.

Elizabeth Gray had an action to send Mike Travis a report about Tritium and confirmed that she has had conversations with Mike. Tritium will now be included in exemption orders.

Cllr Marshall asked Elizabeth what the timescales were to try and resolve this. Elizabeth confirmed it would be the end of 2008 / beginning of 2009 and is part of a much wider review.

## **5. Chapelcross Site Manager's Report**

Mike Travis referred to and gave an update on, his quarterly report using the attached presentation slides. (*see attached to minutes*)

### Questions:

Cooling Towers Blowdown – *Len Moore asked if asbestos will fall from the heat exchangers during the cooling towers blowdown?*

Mike Travis explained that there have been calculations done and the distance that the heat exchangers are from the towers is quite considerable and the amount of pressure expected is considerably less than that of a high wind.

## **6. Other reports from SSG Bodies**

### **NII – Les Davies**

Les Davies explained that the NII had published their written report which was distributed along with the agenda and was happy to answer any questions on the report or any other matters.

### **NDA – Stuart Chalmers**

Randall Bargelt sent his apologies for being unable to attend.

Funding situation – this was covered in Mike's presentation, and the amount allocated to Chapelcross is higher than the amount Mike was informed that the Site might expect back in October 2006 and that is in

recognition of the way the Site is performing. The Site is delivering the work required and the NDA's position is to give adequate funding to the Sites' that perform.

Socio Economics – John Farquhar who is currently the Regional 4 Director is going to pick up Socio Economic activity for the NDA for the whole of Scotland and he will be the single point of contact for all Socio Economic issues. He will also be on the NDA evaluation committee, assessing all bids for funding.

Stuart did not have an answer on Bridge House.

Funding for Determined To Succeed over the next 2 years;

**Action on Stuart Chalmers to confirm this funding and explain to Cllr Lindsay how this £15k for each year should be drawn down from the NDA**

**Complete**

Land ownership issue – when the land becomes available the NDA will consider how they want to use it. If they have no use for the land it will go up for sale and the previous owner or their descendants will have the first chance to buy back the land at the current market value. If they decline the offer then it will go to open market for sale.

Willie McNairn, Blackhills Farm raised the issue of drainage problems at his farm. He had minutes from a meeting in 1955 stating that arrangements for drainage were that foul sewerage from the site, the hospital and the temporary marriage quarters would be dealt with by the existing sewerage system and discharged into the river Annan. In 1971 when properties were sold UKAEA blocked off the sewerage system and by doing this it has had a detrimental effect on Blackhills Farm. No-one was told at the time and it has only been in the past two years when Mr & Mrs McNairn have had to deal with the problem.

**Action on Stuart Chalmers to investigate this matter**

**Complete**

Willie McNairn also asked when the final submission of Socio Economic Policy and the review that took place will be put on the internet?

**Action on Stuart Chalmers to find out**

**Complete**

## **7. Chapelcross SSG Sub-Groups update**

***Several SSG Sub-Group meetings had taken place since the last SSG meeting, and the appropriate minutes of the Sub-Groups had been circulated to members. Chairman asked for endorsement of the decisions made at these meetings***

- ***Socio-Economic***

Alastair Laird reminded the SSG of the terms of reference for the Socio Economic Sub Group and one of the main pieces of work recently was to respond the consultation on the NDA Socio Economic Policy. John Farquhar attended a Sub Group meeting back in January and he welcomes all bids to be tabled that the Sub Group feel are ready.

There are 3 bids now at the stage for SSG Endorsement:

- Annandale & Eskdale Community Fund – Alastair gave an overview of the fund and Steve Southam also provided an input. Cllr Marshall added his comments about the positives of this fund. Cllr Ogilvie reminded the SSG that the distribution of the Foot & Mouth fund locally backed up the experience of the local Council in the governing of the proposed fund.
- Business Liason Officer – again Alastair gave an overview with input from Janice Rough.
- Gretna Landmark Project – Alastair gave an overview of this project with comments from Steve Southam.

### Questions & Observations:

*A member of the audience asked if the Gretna Landmark Project would be a permanent reminder of the Cooling Towers, as this was the impression given in the proposal document?*

Steve Southam replied no, the Landmark would not be based on the cooling towers and that there will be designers employed to share their ideas on what the design of the Landmark should look like.

The three project bids were endorsed by the SSG.

Minutes from the meetings held on 22<sup>nd</sup> January and 14<sup>th</sup> February 2007 were endorsed by the SSG.

- **Community Support**

Minutes from the meetings held on 15<sup>th</sup> December 2006, 12<sup>th</sup> January and 16<sup>th</sup> February 2007 were endorsed by the SSG.

Cllr Marshall and the Chairman both expressed their support for this funding and how it has been of benefit to the local community.

- **Education Support**

Minutes from the meetings held on 6<sup>th</sup> December 2006, 22<sup>nd</sup> January and 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2007 were endorsed by the SSG.

Cllr Marshall highlighted some of the projects that have benefited from this funding. He also made the point that it is not just money that goes into the educational projects but also people's time and the Young Drivers project is a good example of this. Janice Rough distributed the criteria for this sub-group.

Questions:

*The Chairman asked if the secondary schools on the periphery of the GLA benefit from this group i.e. Moffat and Langholm.*

Janice Rough confirmed that all four secondary schools in the region are fully engaged and benefit from this funding.

*Cllr Ogilvie made an observation that even the modest amounts of money distributed from this group goes a long way and makes a big difference.*

*Alastair Laird asked about the Energy Foresight Programme which is being funded across the UK by the NDA, he asked Stuart Chalmers what his expectation was of how a site like Chapelcross and the SSG should respond to the initiative as it is quite a significant amount of money that has been invested?*

Stuart Chalmers agreed to take the action away and come back with an answer.

**Action on Stuart Chalmers**

**Complete**

- **Site End States & Space Unlimited**

Minutes from the meetings held on 8<sup>th</sup> December 2006, 15<sup>th</sup> January and 21<sup>st</sup> February 2007 were endorsed by the SSG.

Paul Allan, Site End State Sub-Group Chair gave an overview of each of the options, the process and the documents that have been produced as a result of the consultation process. He then described in detail the Decision Conference that took place on Wednesday 21<sup>st</sup> of February 2007 where the evidence from the consultation process was scrutinised and each option was considered and given a rating of 'unacceptable', 'could live with' or 'preferred option'.

Paul then gave the recommendation as follows:

- *We want the site cleared quickly so that it can be re-used. We know there will be competition for funds, so we need the whole community behind us as we press the NDA to give the workforce the means to do the job.*
- *We note that the decision as to whether to clean up to Brownfield or Greenfield does not have to be taken until we are a decade or so down the line, by which time we will have a much clearer picture of what use can be made of the site.*

***We therefore recommend pressing on with the decommissioning and the release of the land as fast as is practicable with the final decision between Options 4 & 5 (or something in between) being taken with it is sensible to do so.***

Cllr Ogilvie commented on the funding situation for the 25 year model. Whatever option is chosen there is a cost associated with that and we don't want the expectations of the public raised on early site clearance if the funding is not there to take this forward.

The Chairman asked for the SSG to endorse that a letter should be sent to Ian Roxburgh which explains the unique situation at Chapelcross and to lobby for the 25 year early site clearance. This was endorsed by the group.

Cllr Marshall added his comments of support for the 25 year early restoration model and these were supported by Elaine Murray MSP.

Len Moore raised a concern that this consultation was about 'end state' and not 'end use'. He suggested that there was no guidance on timescales and no input from the Scottish Executive or the NDA.

David Collier from Quintessa mentioned that a select few of the young people from Lockerbie Academy attended one of the stakeholder panels, no allowances were made for the fact they were so young and they contributed greatly to the panel.

Alastair Laird gave a presentation on the Space Unlimited project. British Nuclear Group, Chapelcross teamed up with Lockerbie Academy and set a group of pupils the following dilemma of: **What would young people like to see at Chapelcross in 2030?**

The results of their online survey showed that the top choice was a sports centre, with a theme park and shopping centre coming in second and third choice respectively. Alastair commented that these choices show that the young people have a view on the inadequacy of the current local infrastructure. The young people fed back their results in a presentation based on the 'Deal or No Deal' gameshow.

Elaine Murray MSP commented that she was disappointed that no Nuclear or science centre popular with the young people.

Mike Travis suggested that there was perhaps an opportunity to start considering alternative uses for some of the site early on if there is a desire and political will and if the funding is available.

#### Questions & Observations:

*Cllr Graham explained how Gretna had lost a secondary school and would like the young people of Gretna to be considered as a community without it being via a school.*

The chairman responded by raising the point that Gretna is looked on favourably in other projects that have been mentioned today.

**Cllr Ogilvie formally moved that Option 4/5 be recommended to the NDA and this was seconded by Cllr Marshall.**

The Chairman gave a vote of thanks to everyone who has been involved in this consultation process, the deadlines have been met and the proper procedures were followed.

- **Review of the Constitution**

The chairman announced that the sub-group would meet to review the constitution and present for adoption after the May 2007 elections.

- **CORWM**

This sub-group responded to the consultation of COWRM, however there was some unanswered questions and they have asked that the sub-group participate again in a new consultation. The Chairman asked if it was okay to reconvene the sub-group again to allow the SSG to have an input as requested.

Elizabeth Gray stated that CORWM are doing this piece of work on behalf of the Government. She provided an update on the situation.

#### Questions & Observations:

*Cllr Ogilvie asked about the end state and ILW repository – will CORWM come up with the solution of a National Repository for ILW? Also the UK government did an energy review and consultation which was challenged in court. If we go through this process will the solution be robust enough because there is an*

*awful lot of work done by a lot of people to be thrown out just because someone is not in favour of the decision?*

Elizabeth Gray replied saying CORWM will not solve the ILW repository issue. Also with any consultation it is the intent to ensure the solution is sufficiently robust so it will not be challenged. But you have to recognise that people will always try to challenge. The process will be open and transparent but some people may not like the outcome.

## **8. Site End States Presentation & SSG Recommendation**

See Agenda Item 7 – Site End States & Space Unlimited.

## **9. Date of next meeting.**

Friday 6<sup>th</sup> June 2007 at 7pm in the Council Chambers, Annan. There will be a Special SSG with regards to the cooling towers project and the date and time of that meeting will be published in the newspapers.

## **10. Any Other Business.**

*Cllr Marshall referred to the local U, B & A class roads and the amount of HGV's travelling along these roads. There are many factors contributing to this high use such as quarries, the construction of the Minsca Windfarm, the work being carried out on the Cumberland Gap and also the closure of the Lockerbie to Langholm road. Cllr Marshall asked about the waste arisings from Chapelcross especially after demolition of the cooling towers. What waste will be transported off site i.e. volumes / types / recycling?*

Mike Travis responded to this by stating that the waste associated with the demolition of the cooling towers is mainly packing materials (plastic/asbestos/timber). The plastic packing has gone to a landfill site in Cumbria and the other internal material has gone to a specialised landfill site in North West England. In terms of traffic movement the bulk is nearly at a close in terms of the cooling towers as the intent with the actual blowdown and demolition is to rubalise the concrete, remove the reinforcing bar and leave the concrete in situ on the site. In relation to de-fuelling there will be around 3 flask moves (lorry-loads) per week. Other waste moves up to care and maintenance will be progressive and mainly low level waste to the repository in Cumbria. No large waste moves are forecast.

Dave Wilson added to this by saying that bulking skips are now being used to transport waste, which means much larger vehicles but requires a lesser number of journeys. The Site is also looking to re-use as much waste as possible for backfilling / landscaping etc.

Mike Travis confirmed that the Site is trying to recycle as much material as possible and an example of this will be the reinforcing bar from the cooling towers.

The Chairman commented that he had heard that some materials had been recycled for horses. Philip Jones replied that there had been cork removed from CO2 tanks which is being used by an equestrian centre.

*Helen McNairn, Blackhills Farm read out a letter that has been sent to the NDA regarding the drainage issues at Blackhills Farm.*

This referred back to an issue discussed earlier that Stuart Chalmers agreed to take an action away on behalf of the NDA. David Orr from SEPA has also agreed to speak with Helen regarding this issue.

*Mike Travis referred to the sale of the company and at the June SSG there may be a new owner representation on the SSG. He assured that through the new employer there will be an effort to keep continuity. The Chairman also noted that the Councillor representation may also change after the elections.*

*Len Moore commented that although the Chapelcross Site was passed from the RAF to UKAEA to BNFL, there is still a legal and moral obligation to carry on the responsibility of reinstatement and sale of the land.*

The Chairman thanked everyone for attending this meeting.